

Message # 1

**Message Key:** 0003144F8200A3EF5B432AB2CE740AF1E94943CE  
**From:** [REDACTED]  
**To:** Christopher Taylor <C.Taylor@gov.je>  
**Subject:** Hospital Policy group  
**Date:** Wednesday, October 03, 2018 13:34 BST  
**Attachments:** BDPFrenchHosp.pdf (2.5 MB)



Article 25

Dear Chris,

I attach the report on the comparison of building costs between French and English hospitals to which I referred at our meeting yesterday which you may find interesting reading and confirming our report on the hospital in Brittany in 2016.

Regards,

[REDACTED]

----- End Of Message -----

Message # 2

**Message Key:** 0003144FB06BF181877516884773C3B2DE0295EA 

**From:** [REDACTED]

**To:** Christopher Taylor <c.taylor@gov.je>

**Cc:** John Le Fondre <j.lef@gov.je>, Rowland Huelin [REDACTED], r.huelin@gov.je

**Subject:** Evidence in Support of the Taylor Board Review

**Date:** Friday, October 05, 2018 13:46 BST

**Attachments:** Ignored Advice During Site Selection.docx (2.6 MB), text/html (216 B), Fourteen Reasons Why the New Hospital Plan Will not Work 280818.docx (196.8 KB), text/html (17.6 KB)

Dear Chris,

Page 8 of today's JEP reminded me that I had not sent you an e-copy of my evidence of political interference in the decision making process regarding the location of Jersey's Future Hospital (JFH).

It is very sad to see that discussions between you and Richard Renouf have been leaked to the media. Even sadder is the allegation that Richard is for Gloucester Street without any regard for the evidence of the fallacy of that decision and its implications to the health of the island during the construction process. The reality is that there has been political interference throughout the site selection process and the result is, in my view, an unworkable solution that is going to cost more than it should (because it is a compromise), take longer than it should because of the limitations of the chosen site and the need to keep the General Hospital working throughout the construction process and the ballooning cost. [REDACTED] we have already spent more than 27 million in preparing for the JFH, including rafts of reports from consultants and we now need to draw a line, remember the history of the General Hospital and build a new hospital that is fit for the 21st century and flexible enough to cope with population increases, the advance of medical science, the inclusion of a radiation service and a reduction in the cost of sending patients off island for their treatment.

It is not difficult as the example of the hospital at Plerin, west of St Brieuc shows on their website: <http://www.hopitalprive22.fr/>

This hospital has 300 beds, 15 operating theatres, is state of the art, took 36 months to build from concept to key and cost €49 million. It is all in my document, attached. Please read it and my other brief for politicians, also attached.

These are desperate times and none of us want to be associated with failure, particularly this generation of our Government who will be judged in 2022.

We need to get the JFH onto the right site and that is anywhere but Gloucester Street.

Yours,

[REDACTED]

Message # 3

Message Key: 0003144F2D18FDC181B7532D53A73025229ACB24



From: [REDACTED]  
To: Christopher Taylor <C.Taylor@gov.je>

Subject: USEFUL INFORMATION

Article 25

Date: Monday, October 08, 2018 10:22 BST

Attachments: VERBAL SUBMISSION MADE AT THE PUBLIC INQUIRY - SEPTEMBER 2018.docx (26.9 KB), FRENCH HOSPITAL INFORMATION.docx (22.7 KB)

Dear Chris

Please open the 2 enclosed attachments which I hope will be helpful and useful to you before the next and final States debate on the siting of our new Hospital.

Your comments would be appreciated.

Thank you

Yours sincerely

[REDACTED]

----- End Of Message -----

## Message # 4

**Message Key:** 0003144F49D82F9ED388F4395E8D76BC86E3775E  
**From:** [REDACTED]  
**To:** Christopher Taylor <c.taylor@gov.je>  
**Subject:** Plérin  
**Date:** Sunday, October 21, 2018 15:01 BST



Dear Chris,

I am writing this to you privately in order to unravel what was, and could be, a good idea.

I am sure that you are aware that we, as a group, have been looking at the background to and construction of a new 300 bed hospital in Plérin, just west of St Brieuc. It has been in operation for 2 years now and was delivered in 36 months, from conception to the key in the door, at a cost of €49 million, or about a tenth of the projected cost of our new hospital.

[REDACTED] to get in touch with Rowland to offer to take you and one or two others on a day visit to the Plérin Hospital, flying in and out of St Brieuc [REDACTED]. We have written to [REDACTED] in St Brieuc giving him the necessary background questions to answer and the plan would be to discuss the project planning with the architect and then go on to visit the hospital.

The problem is that Rowland has come back to [REDACTED] today to say that a visit is being organised through the French government for the whole of your Board. Of course that is fine, but the time this will take to organise is, in my view, unhelpful to you, as your report is due in on 31st October and then to go to the CM on or about 17th November. I also doubt that it would occur to the French authorities to involve the architect, which would mean that you would miss half the story.

The reason why I am not suggesting taking the whole Board is that [REDACTED] plane can only seat 5 people and it is essential for liaison reasons that one of them is [REDACTED], as it was his discovery in the first place and he has the local contacts. Therefore, if you are happy to take up my suggestion, please would you consider just yourself and Ms Alves going? (My reasoning is that she is clearly supportive of you and is a member of Sam Mezec's 'party', thus potentially getting their support on board in the forthcoming, PST report, States debate - whenever that happens.)

Yours,

[REDACTED]

[REDACTED] You may wish to comment on the arbitrary changes to the original plan, like no hydro pool in the new Westaway House physio Department, or nurses accommodation, as well as this LINAC machine, as examples of gratuitous and damaging decisions taken apparently without regard to patient care, let alone reducing out year costs, as yet more evidence of compromises made due to the size of the Gloucester Street site.

Sent from Yahoo Mail for iPad

----- End Of Message -----

Message # 5

**Message Key:** 00031453F4419BB3429CE889D2CABA471635D61F 

**From:** [REDACTED]

**To:** [REDACTED]

**Cc:** "TAYLOR, CONSTABLE (c.taylor@gov.je)" <c.taylor@gov.je>, "DEPUTY ALVES [REDACTED]"  
"DEPUTY POINTON [REDACTED]"

**Subject:** SENT TO THE PEOPLE WE MET IN FRANCE

**Date:** Monday, November 12, 2018 09:52 GMT

Article 25

Dear Sirs

I write on behalf of the delegation from Jersey who visited you last Thursday in Plerin, to say thank you very much. The purpose of our visit was to see, to hear, and to understand. Because of your professionalism, we were able to achieve each of those objectives. Some English, some French, and much français was spoken, but we did understand everything we were told verbally and also with the help of the excellent presentation and the superb file you put together for us. We were very impressed with the Hospital Prive at Plerin. We will be sharing the information we obtained with several people, including States members in order to convince them that they need make contact with your company in relation to the building of our new General Hospital. I hope and trust that before long, that will happen.

Personally, if there is anything I can do to help any of you at any time, please do not hesitate to contact me.

Yours sincerely

[REDACTED]

----- End Of Message -----

Message # 6

**Message Key:** 000314530929EB404E01204A309D17462313DBD8  
**From:** [REDACTED]  
**To:** Christopher Taylor <c.taylor@gov.je>  
**Cc:** John Le\_Fondre [REDACTED]  
**Subject:** Jersey's Future Hospital  
**Date:** Monday, November 19, 2018 20:31 GMT



Article 25

Dear Chris,

[REDACTED] We just wanted to make sure that you were alerted about a JEP article about Plerin before it actually came out.,

Thank you for producing a really good report pointing out other, better sites than Gloucester Street, namely that the Waterfront and Overdale and I hope that it is taken seriously by States Members, as a lot of time and money has been spent in the last 6 years to get where we are today with no real understanding of where the optimum site is to be able to deliver Jersey's Future Hospital. That said, our group feels strongly that St Saviour's Hospital and Warwick Farm also need to be considered in the same way and at the same time so that a fair comparison of price and construction time can be made. Every site has advantages and disadvantages, but weighing these up in a fair way is the only way to make the best decision for Jersey.

I understand that a delegation consisting of yourself, the Chief Minister, the Health Minister, Charlie Parker, and [REDACTED], the Deputy of St Lawrence, Gregory Guida, might be paying a visit to the Hospital Prive in Plerin in the near future. That is very good news. We believe that you may also be considering asking A.I.A. the company who built the Hospital in Plerin to carry out a feasibility study on several alternative sites in Jersey. By including the four sites mentioned, you will have four different prices together with four different build times.

We acknowledge that Overdale is large enough for a complete Hospital, but so are St Saviours Hospital and Warwick Farm. We also acknowledge that the Waterfront, although mentioned in your report, is unlikely to be chosen as not only is the site very valuable, but also getting on site to build a hospital is entirely dependent on the promised 550 space underground car park being built in order to vacate the temporary car park at present supporting Jersey's new finance centre and, as you point out in your report, Jersey needs a new hospital now, not in 10 to 15 years.

To an extent, in our view, the same applies to Overdale, as there are facilities there, specifically the rehabilitation centre, which would require re-locating in order to build the new hospital. In addition clearing the site and getting planning permission to do so and then build a hospital is going to take a lot of time, as the key to the Overdale site is a new approach road through the King George V housing estate. It is very good news that it is owned by Andium Homes and again there will be a delay in demolishing the existing buildings, re-housing the occupants and getting planning permission to build the new access road. In addition, as pointed out in the Atkins report, there are likely to be protests over the removal of trees on the west of the site that are apparently very special and whose removal will inevitably speak protests from environmentalists. Nothing is simple!

I know that you were pleased to visit the Plerin hospital and to talk to the build consortium, AIA. The cost of this project, from start to finish was 101 million and the time to complete the project from first thought to completion was 48 months. The key to this was the experience of AIA and the fact that they were developing a green field site. If you take that as a model, then building on Warwick Farm or St Saviour's could take a similar time, could start very quickly by comparison with the Waterfront and Overdale and cost about 200 million, at worst. Furthermore, at that sort of price, Jersey would not have to borrow the huge amount of money that is currently planned. The calculation of the cost of the proposed bond over 47 years when added to the estimated cost of Gloucester Street brings the project total to 1.2 billion over that period, meaning that our great, great grandchildren will still be paying for it.

Politically there is a reluctance to build 'outside town' that we simply cannot understand. Guernsey's Queen Elizabeth hospital is outside St Peter Port and works perfectly well. We live on a small island and any money we can save on this project has to be to the benefit of all. If 35% of people are concerned to have the hospital in town, then 65% are happy not to. Therefore, please include them within your shortlist.

I think we can all agree that in ten years' time St Saviours Hospital will not look like it does today. If it is used for a village, as Andrew Green intimated it could be, then the only people to benefit from it will be the families who live there. On the other hand, if it was used for our new Hospital, the whole population would benefit from it. The priority has to be to produce a new hospital in the shortest time and at the best price. Handing over Warwick Farm and St Saviour's for public housing may seem to be a good idea, but surely not if it is going to cost Jersey many millions more to put the new hospital at Overdale and take a lot more time than building on either St Saviour or Warwick Farm..

I hope that your proposed visit to Plerin, together with John Le Fondre and a mollified Richard Renouf goes well. If you follow the Plerin model there is a very good chance that Jersey's new hospital will be well under way by the next election, which would be a huge achievement by you and your fellow States members. As for the offer by AIA to produce site appraisals at cost on the shortlisted sites, at a total cost, including reports, models and their travel and subsistence costs while here of under 490K is a bargain and, if publicised, would show the people of our island that you are actually making more progress in 6 weeks that has been made in the last 6 years.

Yours,

██████████

----- End Of Message -----

## Message # 7

Article 25

<b>Message Key:</b>	00031453B5837F205958BB515A730FDDDF7DA771	
<b>From:</b>	██████████	
<b>To:</b>	c.taylor@gov.je	
<b>Subject:</b>	Hospital e-mail	
<b>Date:</b>	Tuesday, November 20, 2018 09:07 GMT	

Dear Chris,

In the last paragraph of my e-mail to you last night I gave a figure of 490K as the cost of the feasibility studies. It should read 40K and that is for 3 studies and for the travel, accommodation and food for the 3 person team, plus a hire car while they are here.

Sorry for the confusion!

Yours,

██████████

Sent from my iPad

----- End Of Message -----

Message # 8

Message Key: 00031453C7C3A348263C20D0A5DF580F00EC25DF 

From: [REDACTED]

To: [REDACTED]

Cc: Christopher Taylor <c.taylor@gov.je>, John Le\_Fondre [REDACTED] Article 25

Subject: Re: Jersey's Future Hospital

Date: Tuesday, November 20, 2018 09:48 GMT

Dear [REDACTED] Article 35

[REDACTED]

I wholly support the view that the aim should be to provide a new hospital for much less than the estimated 466 million for the Gloucester St. development I think we need an expert appraisal of the different sites by an established hospital construction group such as AIA before dismissing any from consideration. All the sites will have some expense attached to provide access or services which will be reflected in the total development cost. We know that it is unlikely that one will be able to replicate the figure for building the hospital at Plerin but it should be possible to build one for a figure of much less than 466million which will avoid the Island having to borrow 275million.

That and having a hospital with all facilities on one site in a location conducive to recuperation and healing with parking for patients, staff and visitors in an open environment should be the aim. I believe Overdale would provide the opportunity to achieve that and hope that an appraisal will confirm it.

Regards,  
[REDACTED]

Sent from my iPad

Duplicate of email 6 removed

Message # 9

**Message Key:** 000314531406CE37B4AD4520F611277F38E940B8 

**From:** [REDACTED]

**To:** "TAYLOR, CONSTABLE (c.taylor@gov.je)" <c.taylor@gov.je>

**Cc:** "DEPUTY ALVES [REDACTED]", "DEPUTY POINTON (t [REDACTED])"

**Subject:** LETTER TO THE EDITOR RE OUR NEW HOSPITAL

**Date:** Monday, November 26, 2018 12:50 GMT

**Attachments:** LETTER TO THE EDITOR - NOVEMBER 2018.docx (25.5 KB) Article 25

Dear Chris

Please open the enclosed attachment.

Kind regards

[REDACTED]

----- End Of Message -----

## Message # 10

<b>Message Key:</b>	00031454F108E8A7E784DC42600F32CFEE7A4F01	
<b>From:</b>	[REDACTED]	Article 25
<b>To:</b>	"TAYLOR. CONSTABLE (c.taylor@gov.je)" <c.taylor@gov.je>	
<b>Cc:</b>	"ALVES. C (c.alves@gov.je)" <c.alves@gov.je>, "POINTON. Trevor (t.pointon2@gov.je)" <t.pointon2@gov.je>	
<b>Subject:</b>	HOSPITALS BUILT BY AIA FROM 2014 TO 2018 INCLUSIVE	
<b>Date:</b>	Thursday, January 10, 2019 15:44 GMT	
<b>Attachments:</b>	REFS HOSPITALIERES_2014-2018_AIA Life Designers.pdf (903.3 KB)	

Please open the enclosed attachment.

Thank you.

Yours sincerely

[REDACTED]

----- End Of Message -----