

# Migration Policy Development Board



---

Migration Policy Development Board (the 'Board' or the 'MPDB') Meeting 9  
Thursday 11<sup>th</sup> July 2019, 14.00 – 16:00

---

Board:

Assistant Chief Minister, Connétable Christopher Taylor (CT) (Chair)  
Minister for Social Security, Deputy Judy Martin (JM)  
Minister for the Environment, Deputy John Young (JY) – from 14:50  
Dr Michael Oliver (MO)  
Murray Norton – Jersey Chamber of Commerce (MN)  
John Shenton – Institute of Directors (JS)

Executive Support:

Sue Duhamel – Policy Director (SD)  
Neil Stocks – Policy Principal, Immigration & Migration Policy (NS)  
Matthew Viney – Policy Principal (MV)

Apologies:

Deputy Rowland Huelin (RH)  
Senator Sarah Ferguson (SF)

---

1. Welcome, apologies and minutes of last meeting

1.1. CT welcomed everyone to the meeting. Apologies were noted from SF and RH.

1.2. The minutes of Meeting 8 on the 27<sup>th</sup> June 2019 were agreed by the Board.

1.3 JS raised the following point of clarification in relation to the statistics published by Statistics Jersey entitled - "Estimating Government Receipts and Expenditure from Jersey Households"<sup>1</sup>. This report was presented to the Board at a previous meeting.

For completion – the question and response from Statistics Jersey are included below:

---

1

<https://www.gov.je/SiteCollectionDocuments/Government%20and%20administration/R%20Government%20Receipts%20and%20Expenditure%2020190423%20SJ.pdf>

Email query from JS:

*"Can I ask you a quick question about slide HH9*

*If I take a simple example say £85k then I have a positive in the last column of £926. The graph suggest that £85k is therefore breakeven.*

*However this positive ignores the estimated receipts from the SS Fund, Health Fund and LTC Fund – why is this ?*

*Many thanks*

*John"*

Response from Statistics Jersey:

*"Afternoon John,*

*No problem - Put simply, that is how that particular output (the net balance) was requested to be constructed.*

*The net balance shown is looking at income and expenditure that relates to what is sometimes referred to as "Government General Revenue and Expenditure", and does not include the in and out flows of the ring fenced funds. The exception to this is the application of the States Grant into the Social Security Fund (supplementation), which is included given the fact that it is a sizable element of General Revenue Expenditure (which also acts as a receipt into the Social Security Fund).*

*We have included within the outputs the receipts in to the SS, Health and LTC funds as these are in effect calculated anyway as part of the construction of the estimates (you need to know the inputs into the SS Fund in order to calculate the level of supplementation, and LTC effectively comes straight from the income tax calculation) – and these may be useful to people in forming a more complete view / looking at other areas (some of which are mentioned in the back of the report). We have not, as part of this piece of work, looked at expenditure from those funds (which does get somewhat convoluted particularly in respect of things such as the old age pension and LTC as these expenditures are likely to not be at the same time or even the same individuals as when the receipts are made into those funds).*

*I believe the rationale behind wanting to construct the net-balance in this way (keeping the funds outside of scope), was in part to look purely at the monies that would be available to government to spend (the funds are ring fenced), and also because the SS fund (by far the largest of the three) has its own separate actuarial assessment done. The SS Fund also behaves in quite a different way in respect of the impact of migration upon it, largely due to the nature of supplementation which results in the actual receipts into the fund being broadly independent of the earnings of individual workers.*

*Hopefully that makes sense, but if you need anything clarified, or have any further questions just let me know."*

## 2. Update on Scrutiny Review of the Migration Policy Development Board.

2.1 NS and SD gave a brief update on the meetings that had taken place with Scrutiny.

## 3. No Chamber of Commerce update given.

## 4, 5 & 6 Timetable & Review of the work of the Board

4.1 The Chair advised the Board that the primary goal of this meeting was to identify any areas where additional information was needed (if any). This is in order to ensure that at the September meeting the Board would be in a position to discuss policy options.

4.2 NS provided a high-level summary presentation of the work the Board had carried out so far, including the potential policy options that had arisen. The presentation also included a proposed timetable for future work. NS reiterated that the purpose of today's meeting was for the Board to agree the scope of the work to be undertaken by Officers over the summer.

4.3 The Board engaged in a lengthy and varied discussion, principally in relation to the current elements of legislation – key areas of discussion included potential levers that can be used to give more control over migration, the roles of HAWAG and Jersey Business School, the importance of skills, the need for flexibility in any control, and alignment with immigration processes.

*JY joined the meeting – 14:50*

4.4 Several possible policy options were discussed as well as the potential impact of policy changes.

The key areas arising were changes to the current CHWL permissions, the potential negative impact on businesses of changes, the development of an adaptable permit system that allows people to develop in a role, holding new businesses to account in respect of the type of operation they run and the tax they pay, whether locally based businesses should receive greater support with regard licencing, than those based overseas, who was best placed to determine where permissions should be issued, the importance of accurate and timely data on which to base decisions, plans to introduce electronic census, criminal record checks and photographic/digital identification.

## 7. Policy Options & Policy Development – Discussion Paper for September

NS summarised the meetings discussions. The Board confirmed that they would like to progress with further research on specific measures that might be utilised to improve current controls on those living and working in the island.

NS advised that the options would be formed into a policy discussion paper to assist with the formation of the Board's initial policy proposals and future consultation.

Action 3 – Policy discussion paper to be prepared.

8. AoB and next meeting

- a. There was no business arising.
- b. The date of the next meeting would be Thursday 5<sup>th</sup> September 2019.
- c. The Chair wished everyone a pleasant summer break. The meeting was closed at 16:35

9. Action Points

	Action required	Allocated to	Required by	Date completed
1	Policy discussion paper to be prepared.	NS	19/09/19	

Minutes agreed

Chairman:



-----

Date:

06/09/2019

-----

Agreement for publication

Chairman:



-----

Date:

06/09/2019

-----

Register of Actions from previous meetings

	No.	Action required	Allocated to	Required by	Date completed
Meeting 1 07/03/19	1	Invite 3 x lay members	NS	15/03/19	08/03/19
Meeting 1	2	Invite 1 x backbencher	NS	15/03/19	11/03/19
Meeting 2 21/03/19	3	Arrange for Andrew bannister to return for next meeting	NS	04/04/19	26/03/19
Meeting 2	4	Circulate FPP Report to the Board	NS	04/04/19	02/04/19
Meeting 3 04/04/19	5	Revise previous minutes	NS	18/04/19	12/04/19
Meeting 3	6	Circulate papers to the Board	MV	18/04/19	04/04/19
Meeting 4 18/04/19	7	Advice on the feasibility of statistical modelling of the net cost (per individual) of migration	Statistics Jersey/Economics Unit	13/05/19	11/07/19
Meeting 4	8	Circulate dependency ratio report	NS/MV	25/04/19	04/04/19
Meeting 4	9	Circulation of Birth and School attendance statistics	Statistics Jersey/NS/MV	13/05/19	21/05/19
Meeting 4	10	Circulation of average earnings report	NS/MV	25/04/19	07/05/19
Meeting 4	11	Resend EGRESS email to RH	NS	25/04/19	23/04/19
Meeting 4	12	Circulation of paper on migration / population in other jurisdictions	NS	13/05/19	07/05/19
Meeting 5	13	Circulate Guernsey Work Permit Category Paper.	NS	30/05/19	22/05/19
Meeting 6	14	Produce discussion paper from points raised in this meeting.	NS	13/06/19	10/06/19

Meeting 7	15	Officers to analyse the underlying data and provide feedback in the meeting's discussion paper.	NS	27/06/19	20/08/19
Meeting 7	16	Presentation to be circulated. Invite to consultation event to be sent to members.	NS/MV	27/06/19	26/06/19
Meeting 7	17	Discussion paper to be prepared.	NS	27/06/19	20/08/19
Meeting 7	18	Officers to provide stats relating to net nil migration.	NS	27/06/19	27/06/19
Meeting 8	19	NS to arrange circulation and publishing of the presentations on the Policy Board website.	NS	11/07/19	28/06/19