

JERSEY FUTURE HOSPITAL CO004 – SITE OPTION REPORT

APPENDIX 2 Verification of previous site deselection

QUALITY ASSURANCE

Sign off: Terry Langdon

Position: Director





STATES OF JERSEY

FUTURE HOSPITAL PROJECT

No	Site	Reasons for rejection	Rejection	Current position
			stage	
1	Current General Hospital Site	Planning massing guidance was released which introduced a limited building height of five medical floors along Kensington Place, five to six floors on Newgate Street and Gloucester Street and seven floors in the centre of the new hospital building and along The Parade. Proposals non-compliant, requested reconfiguration.	Ministerial consideration of revised short-listed options proposed by WS Atkins	Superseded by Site Options Appraisal Brief (Option C)
1B	Extended General Hospital site (including additional land acquisition)	Did not out-perform original Site 1 proposal	Revised short- listed options analysis by WS Atkins	Superseded by Site Options Appraisal Brief (Option C)
1C	Extended General Hospital site along Kensington Place, with retention of Granite Building	Proposal offered less efficient ward layouts with extended patient routes to other related clinical departments but also presented a six-storey, solid facade to Kensington Place.	WS Atkins test of alternative design solutions available at site 1	Superseded by Site Options Appraisal Brief (Option C)
1D	Extended General Hospital site along Kensington Place	Proposal presented operational issues regarding efficient clinical links between the extended ward and other related departments.	WS Atkins test of alternative design solutions available at site 1	Superseded by Site Options Appraisal Brief (Option C)
1E	Extended General Hospital site along Kensington Place	Revised Concept proposal requested	WS Atkins SOC Refined Concept Addendum	Superseded by Site Options Appraisal Brief (Option C)





STATES OF JERSEY

FUTURE HOSPITAL PROJECT

No	Site	Reasons for rejection	Rejection	Current position
			stage	
2, 23 and 24	Overdale Hospital and Fields 1550 and 1551 Westmount	Unacceptable impact on community based services which are currently sited at Overdale; the community strategy being to consolidate services on the Overdale site. Vehicular access from main roads to the site is poor.	WS Atkins short-list recommendati on	Superseded by Site Options Appraisal Brief (Options A and B)
2B	Westmount Health Quarter (Overdale Hospital Fields 1550 and 1551, Westmount Quarry and People's Park)	Did not out-perform short-listed proposals	Revised short- listed options analysis by WS Atkins	Superseded by Site Options Appraisal Brief (Option B)
3	St Saviour's Hospital	Planning restrictions exist on the existing buildings on the site which would severely compromise clinical functionality. Access issues and convenience for patients and staff is poor.	WS Atkins short-list recommendati on	No change – rejection valid
4 and 14	Esplanade Car Park, Zephyrus/We stwater/ Crossland	Risk of identifying an alternative financial centre unacceptably high.	MOG 2 nd August 2012	Superseded by Site Options Appraisal Brief (Option D)
5	Former D'Hautree School Site	The smaller part of the site would require a c.8 storey high building on a prominent site above town. To create a larger footprint would require relocation of Highlands College functions which would not be achieved within 3-5 years	SoJ Officer assessment prior to long-list	No change – rejection valid





FUTURE HOSPITAL PROJECT

No	Site	Reasons for rejection	Rejection	Current position
110			stage	Carrone position
6	Former JCG	The majority of the site is occupied by a primary school and the remaining site too small with too many restrictions to accommodate a hospital. Relocating the primary school would take longer than 3-5 years and would have a high cost.	SoJ Officer assessment prior to long-list	No change – rejection valid
7	South Hill	The small size of the available site would present difficulties in accommodating the required volume – it is estimated that a seven storey structure would be required in a prominent location overlooking the harbour.	SoJ Officer assessment prior to long-list	No change – rejection valid
8	Land at Airport	Not in accord with the Island Plan. Site meets minimum area required but neighbouring fuel depot would be a fire hazard and would have to be moved. Transport and access issues considered less optimal than other sites. Exposure to climate also considered an issue.	WS Atkins short-list recommendati on	No change – rejection valid
9	Summerland / Ambulance Station	The site is too small without the ambulance site, which would take longer than 3-5 years to move. Even with the ambulance site, this would be too small a site for a new hospital.	SoJ Officer assessment prior to long-list	No change – rejection valid
10	Warwick Farm	Site not suitable because it would require re-designation of this green zone land site and, in addition, the visual and development impact of such a large building in this rural setting would have been out of keeping with the surroundings coupled with considerable transport impacts which were not considered sustainable.	Ministerial consideration of short-listed options proposed by WS Atkins	No change – rejection valid





FUTURE HOSPITAL PROJECT

No	Site	Reasons for rejection	Rejection	Current position
			stage	
11	Fort Regent	Whilst this site raises a number of questions in terms of access, topology and heritage issues, the current occupancy of the site (i.e. port and concert facilities) would need to be relocated and this was unlikely to be achieved within 3-5 years.	SoJ Officer assessment prior to long-list	No change – rejection valid
12	Snow Hill Car Park	Providing the required volume on a site of this shape and footprint would require a very tall building, in the order of 14 storeys, which would be out of keeping within the local area. The site would also result in an inefficient building shape.	SoJ Officer assessment prior to long-list	No change – rejection valid
13	Elizabeth Harbour	The current port facility would have to be moved in order for this site to be available. There are no plans to do this and this would not be achieved within 3-5 years. The cost of moving the port to provide a hospital are unlikely to be justified.	SoJ Officer assessment prior to long-list	No change – rejection valid
14B	Zephyrus / Crosslands / Cineworld / Les Jardin de la Mer	Proposal rationalised to address issues of planning and massing. Taken forward into 14C.	WS Atkins test of alternative design solutions available at site 14	Superseded by Site Options Appraisal Brief (Option D)
14C	Zepyhrus / Crosslands / Les Jardin de la Mer	Not selection as final recommendation	WS Atkins SOC, October 2013	Superseded by Site Options Appraisal Brief (Option D)
15	Bellozanne Valley	Preliminary plans by Transport and Technical Services show that the area left in the valley once liquid waste facilities have been upgraded would not meet requirements. Location is also problematic as is	SoJ Officer assessment prior to long-list	No change – rejection valid





STATES OF JERSEY

FUTURE HOSPITAL PROJECT

No	Site	Reasons for rejection	Rejection	Current position
		-	stage	·
		co-location with municipal activities such as liquid waste treatment.		
16	Jersey Gas site, Tunnell Street	Site footprint not considered viable for construction of a hospital with optimal clinical adjacencies.	WS Atkins long-list site analysis	No change - rejection valid
17	Le Masurier's land, Bath Street	The site is too small and would require a tall building (c.12 storeys) to meet the likely area requirements. This would be out of keeping with this area of town.	SoJ Officer assessment prior to long-list	No change – rejection valid
18	Former Jersey Brewery, Ann Street	Site has a small footprint which would require a tall building (c.11 storeys). This is out of keeping within the surrounding area.	SoJ Officer assessment prior to long-list	No change – rejection valid
19	Westmount Quarry	Site footprint and topography not considered viable for construction of a hospital with optimal clinical adjacencies.	WS Atkins long-list site analysis	No change – rejection valid
20	Longueville Nurseries, St Saviour	The site is not large enough to support a development in this area and it may not be available within 3-5 years.	SoJ Officer assessment prior to long-list	No change – rejection valid
21	Samares Nurseries, St Clement	A range of travel and accessibility issue a key concern for this site including road capacity and limited site access issues. Not in accord with the Island plan.	WS Atkins short-list recommendati on	No change – rejection valid
22	Field 1219, Grande Route de Mont a L'Abbe	Site footprint not considered viable for construction of a hospital with optimal clinical adjacencies. Very limited site access potential.	WS Atkins long-list site analysis	
25	Parade Gardens	Considered on the basis that the public park could be recreated on the current hospital site, however a covenant on the site prohibits building on it.	SoJ Officer assessment prior to long-list	No change – rejection valid





FUTURE HOSPITAL PROJECT

No	Site	Reasons for rejection	Rejection	Current position
			stage	
26	Springfield	The current facilities would need to	SoJ Officer	No change - rejection
	Stadium	be relocated, which would take	assessment	valid
		longer than 3-5 years, also a key	prior to long-list	
		public amenity in this area.		
27	FB Fields	A covenant on the site prohibits	SoJ Officer	No change – rejection
		building and retains the site for	assessment	valid
		sport. The current facilities would	prior to long-list	
		also have to be relocated.		